



**MONTGOMERY McCRACKEN**

ATTORNEYS AT LAW

**Timothy Semenoro**  
Admitted in New York, New Jersey

437 Madison Avenue  
New York, NY 10022  
Tel: 212-867-9500

Direct Dial: 212-551-7793  
Fax: 212-599-1759  
Email: tsemenoro@mmwr.com

February 15, 2023

**Via ECF**

Honorable Paul A. Engelmayer  
United States District Judge  
Thurgood Marshall  
United States Courthouse  
40 Foley Square  
New York, NY 10007

Re: ***In re: One Apus Container Ship Incident on November 30, 2020***  
***1:22-md-03028-PAE (lead case)***

Dear Judge Engelmayer,

We are attorneys for Chidori Ship Holding LLC and Jessica Ship Holding SA, making restricted appearances as owners and bareboat charterers, respectively, of the M/V ONE APUS. We write jointly on behalf of all Interests - Vessel, Cargo, and NVOCCs – to provide a status report pursuant to Order No. 4 (ECF Doc. 346).

**Settlement discussions**

Liaison Counsel for Vessel Interests and the Cargo Plaintiffs' Steering Committee have corresponded and met again on February 14, 2023. The parties continue to discuss potential settlement levels, vessel defenses, and other considerations. Vessel Interests have been represented in the settlement discussions to date by counsel for Chidori Ship Holding and Jessica Ship Holding, who are the vessel owner and the bareboat charterer. Cargo Interests assert that, to have a more productive discussion of Vessel Interests' defenses and of a practical way to establish a global settlement framework, counsel for the ocean carriers should participate directly in the settlement discussions. As such, Cargo Interests have requested that the vessel operating common carriers participate in future settlement discussions.

Proposals on funding among the Vessel Interests remain ongoing. There have been exchanges amongst the Vessel Interests as to how funding could be accomplished. Vessel Interests are also following up with NVOCCs on potential contributions.

**MONTGOMERY McCRACKEN WALKER & RHOADS LLP**  
PENNSYLVANIA • NEW YORK • NEW JERSEY • DELAWARE

A PENNSYLVANIA LIMITED LIABILITY PARTNERSHIP  
JOHN J. LEVY, NEW JERSEY RESPONSIBLE PARTNER

Montgomery McCracken Walker & Rhoads LLP

February 15, 2023  
Page 2

**Exchange of information in support of settlement discussions**

To assist in understanding the various cargo claims and defenses, the NVOCC Interests have provided dozens of sets of bill of lading terms and conditions to the Vessel Interests. As requested, NVOCC Interests have also provided preliminary views on potential FRCP Rule 12 motions.

Vessel Interests did provide a more detailed explanation of the vessel defenses with corresponding documents to Cargo Interests. This submission was discussed during the recent meeting between Vessel and Cargo Interests and will continue to be discussed as the parties move forward.

Certain recently joined cargo interests have provided additional claim documents for hundreds of lost or damaged containers.

In short, a substantial amount of additional information was exchanged between the parties to assist the settlement process.

We thank Your Honor for your consideration. If there are any questions or concerns, please do not hesitate to contact the undersigned.

Respectfully submitted,

**MONTGOMERY MCCrackEN  
WALKER & RHOADS, LLP**

/s/ Timothy Semenoro

Timothy Semenoro  
Robert E. O'Connor

and

**COLLIER WALSH NAKAZAWA LLP**

Alan Nakazawa  
James I. H. Brooks

*Attorneys for Defendants  
M/V ONE APUS,  
Chidori Ship Holding LLC, and  
Jessica Ship Holding SA*



PAUL A. ENGELMAYER  
United States District Judge  
February 16, 2023

CC by ECF to all counsel of record